

**Puerto Rico Department of Education
Request for Limited Waiver**

Exhibit G

Vendor Evaluation Matrix

(WAN Service)

PRDE FY2014 E-RATE VENDOR EVALUATION MATRIX

RATING: 1-10 (10 is the highest/best)

Members Should Complete Column D & F (Score Column E & G will Auto-Populate)


WAN/INTERNET-OSIATD-2014-001
WIDE AREA NETWORK (WAN)


	CRITERIA	WEIGHT	AT&T		PRTC	
			RATING	SCORE	RATING	SCORE
1	PRICE OF ELIGIBLE PRODUCTS AND SERVICES	35%	4	14%	6	21%
2	PROFESSIONAL QUALIFICATIONS AND EXPERIENCE PROVIDING PROPOSED SERVICES	20%	8	16%	10	20%
3	RESPONSIVENESS OF PROPOSAL TO RFP TERMS, CONDITIONS AND REQUIRED SUBMITTALS, AND QUALITY OF PROPOSED SOLUTIONS AND PRODUCTS	15%	6	9%	10	15%
4	QUALITY OF PROPOSED SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENT (SLA)	15%	10	15%	8	12%
5	E-RATE PROGRAM KNOWLEDGE AND EXPERIENCE	10%	8	8%	5	5%
6	PERFORMANCE ON CONTRACTS WITH COMPARABLE SCOPES OF SERVICES FOR BUSINESSES AND ORGANIZATIONS OTHER THAN PRDE	5%	10	5%	9	5%
		100%	46	67%	48	78%


RECOMMENDATION/COMMENTS:

RECOMMENDATION: 4-YEAR CONTRACT AWARD TO PRTC

See attached Voting Matrix Worksheet showing the Evaluation Committee's detailed scoring of the vendor proposals, and the information considered by the Committee in making its vendor contract award recommendation to the CIO.

BY:  LOURDES DIAZ, Curriculum and Technology DATE: 3/20/2014

BY:  VILMARYS QUINONES, Law DATE: 3/20/2014

BY:  NORMA ROLON, Procurement DATE: 3/20/2014

PRDE FY2014 E-RATE EVALUATION COMMITTEE
VOTING MATRIX WORKSHEET - WIDE AREA NETWORK (WAN)
RFP NO: WAN/INTERNET-OSIATD-2014-001

RATING: 10 POSSIBLE POINTS FOR EACH CATEGORY

3/20/2014

1 PRICE OF ELIGIBLE PRODUCTS AND SERVICES (35%)

INFORMATION CONSIDERED		AVAIL PTS	AT&T	PRTC
1	4-YEAR PRICE TOTAL FOR ELIGIBLE PRODUCTS & SERVICES (INCLUDING MARKET RESEARCH ON RECURRING PRICING)	10	4	6
TOTAL RATING:		10	4	6

WIDE AREA NETWORK (WAN) PRICING EVALUATION SCALE		RANGE	POINTS
PROPOSED PRICING RANGE FOR 4-YEAR TOTAL**		\$10M - \$19M	10
		\$20M - \$24M	9
		\$25M - \$29M	8
		\$30M - \$34M	7
		\$35M - \$39M	6
		\$40M - \$44M	5
		\$45M - \$49M	4
		\$50M - \$54M	3
		\$55M - \$59M	2
		\$60M+	1
PRTC 4 YR TOTAL - \$37,004,400			
AT&T 4 YR TOTAL - \$48,333,189			

2 PROFESSIONAL QUALIFICATIONS & EXPERIENCE (20%)

INFORMATION CONSIDERED		AVAIL PTS	AT&T	PRTC
1	VENDOR WORK EXPERIENCE IN PROVIDING PROPOSED SERVICES	7	5	7
2	RESOURCE EDUCATION AND CERTIFICATION	3	3	3
TOTAL RATING:		10	8	10

3 RESPONSIVENESS OF PROPOSAL TO RFP TERMS, CONDITIONS AND REQUIRED SUBMITTALS, AND QUALITY OF PROPOSED SOLUTIONS AND PRODUCTS (15%)

	INFORMATION CONSIDERED	AVAIL PTS	AT&T	PRTC
1	COMPLIANCE WITH DISCOUNT BILLING REQUIREMENT	2	0	2
2	COMPLIANCE WITH REQUIRED PROPOSAL SUBMITTALS	2	2	2
3	RESPONSIVENESS TO COMMITTEE QUESTIONS & INFORMATION REQUESTS	2	2	2
4	QUALITY OF PROPOSED SERVICES	2	2	2
5	NO TERMINATION PENALTIES OR VENDOR RESTRICTIONS	2	0	2
	TOTAL RATING:	10	6	10

4 QUALITY OF PROPOSED SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENT (15%)

	INFORMATION CONSIDERED	AVAIL PTS	AT&T	PRTC
1	TECHNICAL ADVISOR ANALYSIS OF VENDOR SLA RE: NETWORK AVAILABILITY & CALL QUALITY TARGETS	10	10	8
	TOTAL RATING:	10	10	8

5 E-RATE PROGRAM KNOWLEDGE AND EXPERIENCE (10%)

	INFORMATION CONSIDERED	AVAIL PTS	AT&T	PRTC
1	NUMBER OF RESUMES	3	1	3
2	RESOURCE WORK EXPERIENCE	3	3	1
3	RESOURCE EDUCATION	4	4	1
	TOTAL RATING:	10	8	5

6 PERFORMANCE ON CONTRACTS WITH COMPARABLE SCOPES OF SERVICES FOR BUSINESSES AND ORGANIZATIONS OTHER THAN PRDE (5%)

	INFORMATION CONSIDERED	AVAIL PTS	AT&T	PRTC
1	NUMBER OF REFERENCES	1	1	1
2	CLIENT OVERALL SATISFACTION	4	4	4
3	COMPARABLE SCOPE OF SERVICES ON NON-PRDE CONTRACTS	5	5	4
	TOTAL RATING:	10	10	9